EOID Committee Review Summary: Chen-Parise-Lee proposal for NSLS II DAC program workshop

9/14/2017

Relevance to COMPRES community: Strengths

* The NSLS II, with the world’s highest intensity and exceptional brightness affords opportunity for investigating materials properties at extremely high resolution. The representation of the COMPRES community in practical research areas in this unique research facility is critical for developing world-class research programs that will bring high visibility to the COMPRES.
* The COMPRES DAC program at the NSLS I seems to have been quite active, based on the high publication statistics, but is not being supported under NSLS II. The proposal workshop is useful in evaluating the research demands for the DAC facility and should be useful to COMPRES in prioritizing its research support areas. Such information is particularly useful at this time when new beam lines and associated research programs are being developed at NSLS II.
* The scope of the workshop presented in the proposal is adequate. List of invited speakers is good. Workshop participants will be faculty, and potential outcomes include a proposal and a new facility for the community.

Relevance to COMPRES community: Weaknesses

* The productivity of X17 at NSLS I peaked in 2014 and experienced a decline more than a year before the facility closed. Is this an indication of decline in demand by the community? We agree that beamlines at APS are oversubscribed, but it is unclear whether loss of beamlines at NSLS II placed an additional burden on APS. Proposal cites “emerging x-ray techniques” as motivation, but these are not specified. It would be good to offer more concrete suggestions about techniques that are ideally suited to NSLS II (or at least note that this will be an outcome of the workshop). What unique advantages would DAC XRD facilities at NSLS II have? Would DAC XRD facilities at NSLS be competitors or complements to APS?

Budget: Strengths

* The budget seems reasonable based on the number of participants.

Budget: Weaknesses

* The scheduling is very tight, with only ~45 min allotted for discussion. A one-day meeting may be too short to foster meaningful discussions and produce useful output for COMPRES.
* The short notice may make travel arrangements more difficult for non-local participants. This may be mitigated by delaying the meeting or offering remote participation.
* The venue is not specified besides “Long Island”—would there be any other venue-related costs besides printing?